

UNIVERSITY OF MINNESOTA

Laboratory of Physiological Hygiene School of Public Health
Stadium Gate 27
Minneapolis, Minnesota 55455

November 23, 1977

David P. Earle, M.D. Editor
Jr. of Chronic Diseases
Department of Medicine
Northwestern University Medical School
303 East Chicago Avenue
Chicago, IL 60611

Dear Dr. Earle:

I have reviewed the manuscript entitled, "An Epidemiologic Study of Pulmonary Embolism", by Hamilton and Ostfeld which was sent to Dr. Blackburn for réview.

My confidential judgment of the paper's suitability for publication in the Journal is as follows:

This paper contributes little new information about risk for pulmonary embolism. The few really new or interesting findings such as that of the relationship of race are given only cursory attention. There are major limitations to the use of the case-control design in such a study. These are inadequately discussed and no attempt is made to assess the magnitude of their impact on the results. The main usefulness of this study, i.e., to suggest hypotheses for further study such as the role of race and estrogen use, is not mentioned in the discussion, whereas the proposed contribution to prediction of pulmonary embolism is minimal since most of the associations found were already known. Therefore my recommendation regarding this paper is that it is not suitable for publication in its present form. It might be suitable if major revisions were made along the lines metioned above and those in the reviewers comments.

Over the past year I have reviewed a number of manuscripts for the <u>Journal</u> which were originally sent to Dr. Blackburn. I should like to suggest that it might facilitate prompt review if the manuscripts in my area of competence, which I might be called upon to review, be sent directly to me. I would be willing to serve as an official editorial consultant.

Sincerely yours,

Richard F. Gillum, M.D. Assistant Professor

dlh Enc. on never has to be an editor

solichbin for solichbin for Stillet expertisores will be recognised with a be potient

HEALTH SCIENCES